

CODY SHAVER (SBN 319362)
Shaver Legal, APC
4411 Highland Place
Riverside, California 92506
Tel.: (800) 672-4159
Fax: (951) 848-9489
Email: cshaver@shaverlegal.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff
Alan Rittenberg

MARC S. HINES (SBN 140065)
mhines@lawhhp.com
BRIAN PELANDA (SBN 278453)
bpelanda@lawhhp.com
HINES HAMPTON PELANDA LLP
23 Corporate Plaza, Suite 150
Newport Beach, California 92660
Tel.: (714) 513-1122
Fax: (714) 242-9529

Attorneys for Defendant
Nationwide Mutual Ins. Co.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

ALAN RITTENBERG, an individual,

Plaintiff,

v.

NATIONWIDE MUTUAL
INSURANCE COMPANY, an Ohio
corporation, authorized to do business
in California; and DOES 1 through 25,
inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No.: 5:23-cv-01068-MRA-SHK

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER**

1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this

1 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
2 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends
3 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment
4 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in
5 Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to
6 file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
7 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party
8 seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

9
10 **B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT**

11 Plaintiff Alan Rittenberg has requested that Defendant Nationwide produce
12 information such as its claims handling guidelines and procedures. Nationwide
13 contends that such information is confidential, commercially sensitive, proprietary,
14 and protectible as trade secrets under California Civile Code § 3426 *et seq.*, and thus
15 special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than
16 prosecution of this action is warranted. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of
17 information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of
18 discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep
19 confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of
20 such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling
21 at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such
22 information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information
23 will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so
24 designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential,
25 non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public
26 record of this case.

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Action: this pending federal law suit.

2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.

2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have

1 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which
2 has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

3 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
4 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
5 support staffs).

6 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
7 Discovery Material in this Action.

8 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
9 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
10 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
11 and their employees and subcontractors.

12 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
13 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

14 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
15 from a Producing Party.

16 17 3. SCOPE

18 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
19 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
20 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
21 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
22 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

23 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
24 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

25 26 4. DURATION

27 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
28 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees

1 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
2 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with
3 or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
4 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
5 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
6 pursuant to applicable law.

7
8 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

9 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

10 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
11 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
12 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
13 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
14 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,
15 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
16 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

17 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
18 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
19 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
20 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating
21 Party to sanctions.

22 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
23 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
24 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

25 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
26 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
27 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
28

1 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
2 produced.

3 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

4 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents,
5 but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that
6 the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter
7 “CONFIDENTIAL legend”), to each page that contains protected material. If only a
8 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
9 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
10 markings in the margins).

11 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
12 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
13 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
14 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
15 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the
16 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which
17 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before
18 producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
19 “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
20 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
21 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
22 markings in the margins).

23 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify
24 the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
25 deposition all protected testimony.

26 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for
27 any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the
28 exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend

1 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
2 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected
3 portion(s).

4 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
5 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
6 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
7 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
8 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
9 Order.

10 11 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

12 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
13 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
14 Scheduling Order.

15 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
16 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

17 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
18 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
19 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
20 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
21 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
22 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
23 entitled under the Producing Party’s designation until the Court rules on the
24 challenge.

25 26 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

27 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
28 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this

1 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
2 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
3 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
4 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
5 DISPOSITION).

6 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
7 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
8 authorized under this Order.

9 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
10 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
11 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
12 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

13 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as
14 well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
15 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

16 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of
17 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

18 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
19 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
20 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

21 (d) the court and its personnel;

22 (e) court reporters and their staff;

23 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
24 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
25 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

26 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or
27 a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;
28

(h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the

1 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's
2 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
3 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
4 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action
5 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

6
7 9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
8 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

9 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-
10 Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information
11 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
12 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
13 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

14 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
15 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
16 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
17 confidential information, then the Party shall:

18 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
19 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
20 agreement with a Non-Party;

21 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
22 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
23 specific description of the information requested; and

24 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-
25 Party, if requested.

26 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14
27 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party
28 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery

1 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall
2 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the
3 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
4 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and
5 expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

6
7 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

8 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
9 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
10 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
11 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
12 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
13 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,
14 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and
15 Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

16
17 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
18 PROTECTED MATERIAL

19 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
20 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
21 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
22 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
23 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without
24 prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar
25 as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
26 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
27
28

1 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted
2 to the court.

3
4 12. MISCELLANEOUS

5 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
6 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

7 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
8 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
9 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
10 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
11 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
13 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
14 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
15 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
16 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
17 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

18
19 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

20 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
21 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
22 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in
23 this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
24 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
25 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving
26 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same
27 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies
28 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or

1 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
 2 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any
 3 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
 4 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
 5 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
 6 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
 7 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
 8 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
 9 Section 4 (DURATION).

10
 11 14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate
 12 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
 13 sanctions.

14 Dated: March 21, 2024

HINES HAMPTON PELANDA LLP

15 By: /s/ Brian Pelanda

16 Marc S. Hines

17 Brian Pelanda

18 Attorneys for Defendant

Nationwide Mutual Insurance Company

19 Dated: March 21, 2024

SHAVER LEGAL APC

20 By: /s/ Cody Shaver

21 Cody Shaver

22 Attorneys for Plaintiff Alan Rittenberg

23 **FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

24
 25 Dated: 4/2/2024

26 

27 HON. SHASHI H. KEWALRAMANI

28 United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of

[print or type full address],
declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the
Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for
the Central District of California in the case of Alan Rittenberg v. Nationwide Mut.
Ins. Co., Cas No. 5:23-cv-01068-MRA-SHK. I agree to comply with and to be
bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and
acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment
in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner
any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any
person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.
I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [print or
type full name] of _____ [print or type
full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in
connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this
Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____

1 ATTESTATION OF CONCURRENCE IN FILING

2 I hereby attest and certify that on March 19, 2024, I received concurrence
3 from Plaintiff's counsel, Cody Shaver, to file this document with his electronic
4 signature attached.

5 I certify under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of
6 America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on March 18, 2024.

7
8 /s/ Brian Pelanda
9 Brian Pelanda